MINUTES
CLIMATE ACTION PLAN ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MEETING OF MAY 14, 2014

STEWART-EBERHARDT BUILDING, 22 EAST WEBER AVENUE, STOCKTON CA

1. ROLL CALL (8:21 AM)
   Roll Call
   Present:
   Trevor Atkinson
   John Beckman
   Randy Hatch
   David Nelson
   Matt Richard
   Jeremy Terhune
   Vice Chair Dale Stocking
   Chair Carol Ornelas
   Absent:
   Chris Pedroza, and Trudy Reed.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: October 17, 2013, and November 20, 2013
   Approve the minutes of the October 17, 2013 meeting.
   Moved by: John Beckman, seconded by Trevor Atkinson.
   Vote: Motion carried 7-0
   Yes: Trevor Atkinson, John Beckman, Randy Hatch, Matt Richard, Jeremy Terhune, Vice Chair Dale Stocking, and Chair Carol Ornelas.
   Abstain: David Nelson.
   Absent: Chris Pedroza, and Trudy Reed.
   Committee Member Nelson - abstained from voting on the October 17, 2013 minutes
   Approve the minutes of the November 20, 2013 meeting.
   Moved by: Jeremy Terhune, seconded by Vice Chair Dale Stocking.
   Vote: Motion carried 8-0
   Yes: Trevor Atkinson, John Beckman, Randy Hatch, David Nelson, Matt
Richard, Jeremy Terhune, Vice Chair Dale Stocking, and Chair Carol Ornelas.
Absent: Chris Pedroza, and Trudy Reed.

3. ITEM(S) FOR PRESENTATION/DISCUSSION:

3.01 Presentation: Energy Efficient Retrofit Activity - Green-Up Stockton Ordinance

AICP Planning Manager David Stagnaro introduced the item and the presenter, Amy Dao

Amy Dao, Pacific Gas & Electric Community Energy Manager Sustainable Communities, provided the presentation with the aid of a Powerpoint presentation (filed)

Handout - PG&E Summary for Stockton 2005 to 2012

Comments: the data does not specify Stockton residents; the data tracked purchases within a zip code with a 50-mile radius; not able to track the data to that level; no data to track usage or local savings; an assumption that purchases made in Stockton were used in Stockton; also the possibility that items purchased in Lodi, Tracy or Manteca can be used in Stockton

Deputy Director Forrest Ebbs

Bob Riding, PG&E

Ms. Dao

AICP Planning Manager Stagnaro

Comments: under-the-radar retrofits; the data is tracked by incentives, rebates

Deputy Director Ebbs

Mr. Riding

AICP Planning Manager Stagnaro

Mr. Riding
Question/Comments: the Federal tax rebates are gone this year, how does that affect the retrofit market?; PG&E's portfolio and targets are based on California, the California marketplace is unique as compared to the rest of the country; the driver is the gas or electric rates, and economy; California has cap and trade and the balance of the nation does not; down the line there may be some increases in the gas and electric rates that might incentivize people to make their homes and businesses more efficient

Deputy Director Ebbs

Mr. Riding

AICP Planning Manager Stagnaro

Ms. Dao

Question: is there a typical amount of GHG (Green House Gas) reduction associated with some of these PG&E programs that you could use to substantiate that goals were met?; determining a typical amount of GHG reduction is complicated; there is a calculator available online for the average customer

Committee Member Randy Hatch

Ms. Dao

Mr. Riding

Ms. Dao

Comments: do people change their behavior after they've completed a retrofit, do they behave more efficiently?; that was a problem observed with high efficiency washers and dryers, people were doing more laundry

Deputy Director Ebbs

Theresa English Soto, PG&E

Question/Discussion: referring to the handout, Residential Energy Summary for Stockton 2005 to 2012, since 2005
residential energy usage has gone up by 3.2%; did the number of residential housing units gone up by this same percentage?, are we gaining or losing ground?; this is a per unit increase or an overall increase?; it is a 3.2% increase overall; natural gas usage went up, isn't natural gas cheaper now

Committee Member David Nelson

Deputy Director Ebbs

Ms. Dao

Mr. Nelson

Ms. Dao

Deputy Director Ebbs

Mr. Nelson

Deputy Director Ebbs

Ms. Dao

Discussion: being careful how you look at the metrics, considering the residential data how much per unit is used; other factors with newer homes; explanation of the Climate Zone Averages; would like to see these statistics along with population growth; was the spike caused by the filling of the foreclosures and empty units?;

Mr. Nelson

Deputy Director Ebbs

Ms. Dao

Chair Ornelas

Mr. Riding

Committee Member Jeremy Terhune

Chair Ornelas
Comments: a weather overlay for the Smart Meter data is available on the My Energy webpage; the data on the handout is from 2005, and Smart Meters were probably not fully deployed until later; months before the Smart Meter to a month after the Smart Meter after its deployment, there was dramatic accounting of energy usage

Mr. Riding

AICP Planning Manager Stagnaro

Discussion: a disagreement with the PG&E report, in his opinion the Green Up Stockton criteria was not met; in his opinion there is no ambiguity between units and retrofits; the Ordinance did not state how to quantify if goals were met; there were no funds to administer the Ordinance, the dynamics have changed; move forward with a benchmark that everyone can agree on; PG&E was never expected to be the only agency to provide statistics; PG&E measured what can be measured, in his opinion what could be measured demonstrates that the goal was met; the Ordinance states retrofits and the PG&E report shows that goal was met

Vice Chair Stocking

Ms. Dao

Chair Ornelas

Committee Member John Beckman

Comments: the attempt was to address the older stock that would provide the greatest Green House Gas (GHG) reduction; transportation and the older stock are the two factors to reducing GHG; the PG&E report provided good statistics, a lot of individual efficiencies have been accomplished, but in his opinion the criteria of the Ordinance has not been met; the Ordinance was addressing a total home and a 25 percent energy use reduction on a dwelling unit; a closet aerator does not meet the criteria; if an assessment was completed, it would list everything a house needed, but in reality they
are only going to replace what they can afford

Vice Chair Stocking

Chair Ornelas

Vice Chair Stocking

Comments/Questions: the PG&E memo highlights that we are not sure how to measure success; can the energy usage data be organized by geographic area or city; can you look at a City, identify the usage by zip code with the energy usage data and compare it year by year to see how it is changing; there is no direct correlation to the age of a home and energy efficiency opportunity; create a tool that uses a tier structure, always look for those in a different tier because they're paying the most

Mr. Nelson

Ms. Dao

Mr. Riding, Ms. Dao

Comment: the Achilles heel to the Ordinance is the word "retrofit", there is no definition of "retrofit" in the Ordinance

Deputy Director Ebbs

Comments: the intent was a 25% reduction of energy consumption, with PG&E's help, how do we measure that?; the language needs to change to make the metric work; was the curve flattened out as a result of the retrofits

Mr. Nelson

Mr. Terhune

AICP Planning Manager Stagnar

Comments: how to make the metric work; the PG&E programs have been running in the San Joaquin Valley for 4 to 5 years and it has been difficult to get an absolute
number on the savings; the average savings in Fresno was 28 percent, 25 percent is a realistic goal

Mr. Terhune

Mr. Riding, PG&E

Comments/Discussion: agreed that the retrofits were completed per the Ordinance, in his opinion the Ordinance was poorly written; comment in disagreement; how is a dwelling unit retrofit defined in the Ordinance?; in his opinion, if it was written into the Ordinance, the objective would have only given home buyers information, nothing less; the reason why it wasn’t written in the Ordinance

Mr. Terhune

Vice Chair Stocking

Deputy Director Forrest Ebbs

Vice Chair Stocking

Mr. Beckman

Vice Chair Stocking

Comments/Discussion: the only metrics the committee would have is what PG&E has presented today; in disagreement, PG&E presented information on their energy efficient programs and what items that have been purchased, these items don’t apply to meeting the criteria of the Ordinance; the HERS Rating on new purchased homes would help reach the goal, it only informs the homebuyers

Mr. Beckman

Vice Chair Stocking

Mr. Beckman

Comments: removing "mandatory" from the Ordinance caused everything else to fall through the cracks; the
Committee identified there was no one to monitor this; the Committee was going to review the assessments when they pulled a building permit, they would have to produce a needs assessment; the realtors promised to provide the education; they did away with "mandatory" on the home sales

Chair Ornelas

Discussion/Comments: skepticism that a voluntary program would achieve 25 percent reductions goals; the deadline for the voluntary program was the end of last year; should have results of the program in July 2014; scrapping or rewriting the Ordinance; with the data, the Committee can revise the Ordinance so it will work; what is the Committee's next step; putting some teeth into the Ordinance

Mr. Terhune

Chair Ornelas

Mr. Terhune

Chair Ornelas

Mr. Terhune

Discussion/Comments: PG&E does not keep data on the addresses to track the retrofits; there is no customer-identifiable information associated with the rebates due to PG&E's customer privacy policies, this includes the HERS ratings; other sources data; County program for low-income program for retrofits

Committee Member Matt Richard

Mr. Riding, PG&E

Mr. Terhune

Chair Ornelas

Theresa English Soto, PG&E
Chair Ornelas
Mr. Riding, PG&E
Mr. Nelson
Mr. Riding, PG&E

Discussion/Comments: explanation of the other elements of the Ordinance; meeting subsequent annual goals; the automatic triggering of an mandatory HERS rating

Vice Chair Stocking
Deputy Director Ebbs
Vice Chair Stocking

Discussion/Comments: do we know the number of dwelling units built; approximately 85,000 units were built; questioned why a City would take on penalty clause, or obligate a HERS rating; struggling with the Ordinance’s criteria

Mr. Nelson
Deputy Director Ebbs
Ms. Dao
Mr. Riding, PG&E
Deputy Director Ebbs
Deputy Director Forrest Ebbs
Vice Chair Stocking
Mr. Terhune
Vice Chair Stocking
Deputy Director Ebbs
Vice Chair Stocking
Discussion/Comments: the Council was expecting retrofits, which could be a programmable thermostat because it qualifies as a retrofit, if the Committee isn't happy with that then we need to go back to Council; don't see a requirement for a HERS assessment as part of the Ordinance; disagreement that the goal has been met; retrofit as defined by Energy Upgrade California

Mr. Beckman

Vice Chair Stocking

Mr. Beckman

Deputy Director Ebbs

Mr. Riding, PG&E

Discussion/Comments: what is the Committee's next step; clean up the Ordinance and resubmit to the Council; need to define the terms of the Ordinance; if the Committee doesn't provide the Council something that is practical, it will be watered down or rejected; it has to be something the Council can implement

Chair Ornelas

Mr. Terhune

Mr. Richard

Comments:
AICP Planning Manager Stagnaro - announced that Byron Bogaard, Central Valley Association of Realtors, was invited to this meeting but was unable to attend; Mr. Bogaard indicated he will attend the next Committee meeting

Mr. Nelson - the realtors represent the homeowners; the realtors were concerned for the homeowners; it will be helpful to have Byron at the next meeting

Deputy Director Ebbs - announced that the Green Building Ordinance is scheduled for the next meeting; discussion with the representative of the Central Valley Association of Realtors
Discussion: a suggestion that a sub-committee start looking at the Ordinance-issue, then bring it back to the full committee; call for volunteers; interest to ensure no redundancy with Title 24; an integration of this concept with the Green Building Ordinance (GBO), the two are related; possibility of a sub-committee to deal with the GBO and the energy retrofit issue; items for discussion at the next meeting;

Chair Ornelas

Mr. Terhune

Mr. Hatch

Deputy Director Ebbs

Mr. Terhune

Mr. Hatch

Vice Chair Stocking

Chair Ornelas

Vice Chair Stocking

Chair Ornelas - hold off on forming a sub-committee; agenda items for next month

Theresa English-Soto PG&E introduced Bob Riding, Community Energy Manager Business Impact - Sustainable Communities Central Valley Region

Mr. Riding, PG&E - suggested Mr. Joseph Oldham, State-Wide Coordinator Local Government Commission as a resource for the Committee; AICP Planning Manager Stagnaro agreed

Theresa English Soto, PG&E - adoption rate of the retrofits

Discussion: despite everyone's efforts to make homes more energy efficient, energy usage is still rising; think in
AICP Planning Manager Stagnaro - it was his intention to have PG&E and the Central Valley Association of Realtors at this meeting; Byron Bogaard will attend the next Committee meeting.

Mr. Terhune - announced an invitation to a fund raising event; passed out flyers to Committee members.

Deputy Director Ebbs

Chair Ornelas -

AICP Planning Manager Stagnaro

Mr. Riding, PG&E

Chair Ornelas

4. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS

4.01 Discussion: Regular Climate Action Plan Advisory Committee Meeting Date and Time

Mr. Nelson - had no conflicts with the regularly scheduled meeting date and meeting time; no proposal change the date or time of the regularly scheduled meeting.

5. STAFF COMMENTS / INFORMATION

AICP Planning Manager Stagnaro - it was his intention to have PG&E and the Central Valley Association of Realtors at this meeting; Byron Bogaard will attend the next Committee meeting.

6. PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Terhune - announced an invitation to a fund raising event; passed out flyers to Committee members.

7. ADJOURNMENT (9:50 AM)

SCOTT CARNEY
INTERIM DIRECTOR COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT